



Table 1. Loving Cities Index Indicators, Sources and Benchmarks

Note: In the descriptions for scoring equity below, we consistently refer to “disparity gap.” This is calculated by subtracting the lowest rate among racial groups from the highest to determine the inequity in outcomes from one racial group to another.

CARE

Indicator Definition	Source/year(s)	Scoring Benchmark
Youth Health Insurance: The percentage of children under age 18 with health insurance.	Integrated Public Use Microdata Series, 2015 5-year American Community Survey 2011-2015	Performance: 3 points for >=90% coverage; 2 points 80%-89%; 1 point 70-79%; 0 points <70% Equity: 3 points for <=5% disparity gap; 2 points 6-10% gap; 1 point 11-15% gap; 0 points >15% gap
Access to Healthy Foods: The percentage of the census tract population that resides further than 1/2 mile from a supermarket.	U.S. Department of Agriculture, Economic Research Service, Food Access Research Atlas; U.S. Census Bureau, 2015 5-year American Community Survey (census tract level data) 2011-2015	Performance: 3 points for <=10% food desert status; 2 points 11-20%; 1 point 21-30%; 0 points >30% Equity: 3 points for <=5% disparity gap; 2 points 6-10% gap; 1 point 11-15% gap; 0 points >15% gap
Access to Parks: The percentage of total population within .5 miles/10 minute walk of public parkland.	Trust for Public Land, ParkScore 2016	Performance: 3 points for >=90% access; 2 points 80%-89%; 1 point 70-79%; 0 points <70%
Clean Air Environments: Index of exposure to air toxics for cancer and non-cancer risk combined. Values range from 1 (lowest risk) to 100 (highest risk) on a national scale. The Index value is based on percentile ranking each risk measure across all census tracts in the U.S. and taking the average ranking for each geography and demographic group.	National Equity Atlas (analysis of U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 2011 National Air Toxics Assessment and U.S. Census Bureau, 2014 5-year American Community Survey) 2010-2014	Performance: 3 points for <=30 index; 2 points 31-40; 1 point 40-50; 0 points >50
Healthy Birthweight: The number of singleton infants born at term (at or above 37 completed weeks of gestation) with a birthweight of less than 2500 grams by county, divided by the total number of singleton infants live born at term to county resident mothers, averaged over 2011 to 2015.	Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, National Environmental Public Health Tracking Network 2011-2013	Performance: 3 points for <=10% low birth weight prevalence; 2 points 11-20%; 1 point 21-30%; 0 points >30% Equity: 3 points for <=5% disparity gap; 2 points 6-10% gap; 1 point 11-15% gap; 0 points >50%
Mental Health Supports: access to licensed family mental health providers.	None available	Performance: 3 points for >=90% access; 2 points 80%-89%; 1 point 70-79%; 0 points <70% Equity: 3 points for <=5% disparity gap; 2 points 6-10% gap; 1 point 11-15% gap; 0 points >15% gap Note: No data source existed, but we still scored because of importance, with all cities given 0 points.

LOVING CITIES INDEX

<p>In-School Support Staff: Number of student support staff per 100 students. Student support staff include guidance counselors, instructional aides, and student support services staff.</p>	<p>National Center for Education Statistics, Common Core of Data Data Files, 2014-15 Local Education Agency (School District) Staff and Membership Universe Survey Data</p> <p>2014-2015</p>	<p>3 staff/100 students = 3 points</p> <p>2 staff/100 students = 2 points</p> <p>1 staff/100 students = 1 point</p> <p>Note: This was determined based this on the national average of in-school support staff. According to Brookings Institute there has been about one non-teaching staff for approximately every 27 students (about 3 for every 100 students), a number that has been fairly consistent since the 1990s.¹⁶⁶</p>
--	--	--

STABILITY

Indicator Definition	Source	Scoring Benchmark
<p>Financial Security: The percentage of households with neither a checking nor savings account.</p>	<p>Corporation for Enterprise Development</p> <p>2013</p>	<p>Performance: 3 points for <=10% households without checking or savings; 2 points 11-20%; 1 point 21-30%; 0 points >30%</p>
<p>Livable Wages: The percentage of adults ages 25 through 64 who work full-time with family income below 200 percent of the federal poverty level. Full-time work is defined as usually working at least 35 hours per week and working at least 50 weeks during the year prior to the survey.</p>	<p>Integrated Public Use Microdata Series, 2015 5-year American Community Survey</p> <p>2011-2015</p>	<p>Performance: 3 points for <=10% working poverty; 2 points 10-15%; 1 point 15-20%; 0 points >20%</p> <p>Equity: 3 points for <=5% disparity gap; 2 points 6-10% gap; 1 point 11-15% gap; 0 points >15% gap</p>
<p>Transit Accessibility: The percentage of the population residing within a half mile of transit.</p>	<p>Center for Neighborhood Technology, AllTransit</p> <p>2016</p>	<p>Performance: 3 points for >=90% within half miles of transit; 2 points 80%-89%; 1 point 70-79%; 0 points <70%</p> <p>Equity: 3 points for <=5% disparity gap; 2 points 6-10% gap; 1 point 11-15% gap; 0 points >15% gap</p>
<p>Voter Turnout: Percent of voters in a county that voted in the 2016 general election. Voters include registered voters in all counties except Los Angeles County, where universe includes voter-eligible population.</p>	<p>United States Elections Project</p> <p>2016</p>	<p>Performance: 3 points for >=90% turnout; 2 points 80%-89%; 1 point 70-79%; 0 points <70%</p>
<p>Youth Safety: The number of deaths to persons aged between 1 and 19 years old per 100,000 persons.</p>	<p>Centers for Disease Control and Prevention WONDER Databases</p> <p>2011-2015</p>	<p>Performance: 3 points for <=20 deaths per 100,000; 2 points 20-25 deaths; 1 point 25-30 deaths; 0 points >30</p> <p>Equity: 3 points for <=10 disparity gap; 2 points 10-15 gap; 1 point 15-20 gap, 0 points >20</p>
<p>Housing Cost Burden: The percentage of renter-occupied households with housing costs of more than 30 percent of household income. Housing costs include rent and utilities, including heating fuels.</p>	<p>Integrated Public Use Microdata Series, 2015 5-year American Community Survey</p> <p>2011-2015</p>	<p>Performance: 3 points for <=10% housing cost burden; 2 points 11-20%; 1 point 21-30%; 0 points >30%</p> <p>Equity: 3 points for <=5% disparity gap; 2 points 6-10% gap; 1 point 11-15% gap; 0 points >15% gap</p>

COMMITMENT

Indicator Definition	Source	Scoring Benchmark
Access to Early Childhood Education: The number and rate of Head Start program facilities per 10,000 children under age 5 in each county.	Integrated Public Use Microdata Series, 2015 5-year American Community Survey 2011-2015	Performance: 3 points for $\geq 90\%$ participation in early childhood education; 2 points 80%-89%; 1 point 70-79%; 0 points $< 70\%$
Pre-School Suspension: The number of preschool children receiving at least one out-of-school suspensions; and the percentage of the suspensions by racial group (equity).	Office for Civil Rights Data Collection SY 2013-2014	Equity: 3 points for ≤ 10 pre-school suspensions; If more than 10 pre-school suspensions, 3 points for $\leq 10\%$ difference in proportion of suspensions by race compared to proportion of student population by race; 2 points 11-20% gap; 1 point 21-30% gap; 0 points $> 30\%$ Note: The total percent of the national preschool student population receiving suspensions at a population level is less than 1%, which makes overall performance difficult to reliably score. Still, there are a significant number of children experiencing inappropriate use of exclusionary discipline practices and large inequities in how this affects students of different races. Because of this we focus on scoring equity rather than performance, however cities with below 10 suspensions were deemed to have too small of a sample size to make a reasonable assessment of equity and instead received full points for having seemingly low utilization of exclusionary discipline policies overall.
Suspensions Alternatives: The percentage of K-12 students receiving at least one suspension of any type (e.g. in-school, out of school).	Office for Civil Rights Data Collection SY 2013-2014	Performance: 3 points for $\leq 10\%$ suspension rates; 2 points 10-15%; 1 point 15-20%; 0 points $> 20\%$ Equity: 3 points for $\leq 5\%$ disparity gap; 2 points 6-10% gap; 1 point 11-15% gap; 0 points $> 15\%$ gap
Expulsion Alternatives: The percentage of K-12 students expelled from public school, irrespective of educational service provision or expulsion under zero tolerance policies.	Office for Civil Rights Data Collection SY 2013-2014	Equity: 3 points for ≤ 10 expulsions; If more than 10 expulsions, 3 points for $\leq 10\%$ difference in proportion of suspensions by race compared to proportion of student population by race; 2 points 11-20% gap; 1 point 21-30% gap; 0 points $> 30\%$
Anti-Bullying: The number of K-12 students disciplined for bullying or harassment on the basis of sex, race, color, national origin, or disability divided by the total number of K-12 students.	Office for Civil Rights Data Collection SY 2013-2014	Performance: 3 points for > 0 reports of harassment; 0 points for 0 reports of harassment. Note: several cities reported zero allegations of harassment of bullying, which is more likely a result of under reporting than positive culture. Because this data was unreliable but the indicator is so important, in this version of the Index we gave cities full points for reporting and zero points for not reporting. In the future we hope there is more consistent and comprehensive data collection to score this more rigorously.

CAPACITY

Indicator Definition	Source	Scoring Benchmark
<p>K-8 Gifted curriculum: The percentage of non-secondary schools that offer gifted/talented programs.</p>	<p>Office for Civil Rights Data Collection SY 2013-14</p>	<p>Performance: 3 points for >=90% schools offering gifted/talented programs; 2 points 80%-89% of schools; 1 point 70-79% of schools; 0 points <70% schools</p> <p>Note: Data did not exist on percent of students that attend a K-8 school with gifted programming or participation rates in gifted classes, so we resorted to percent of schools offering and were not able to score equity.</p>
<p>High School advanced curriculum: The percentage of High school students enrolled in at least 1 AP/IB course.</p>	<p>Office for Civil Rights Data Collection SY 2013-14</p>	<p>Performance: 3 points for >=40% students enrolled in 1+ AP/IB course; 2 points 30-39%; 1 point >20-29%; 0 points <20%</p> <p>Equity: 3 points for <=5% disparity gap; 2 points 6-10% gap; 1 point 11-15% gap; 0 points <15% gap</p> <p>Note: the performance scoring is based on the logic that AP/IB are generally intended for Juniors and Seniors, therefore a target of 40-50% of High School students enrolled in at least one AP class is more appropriate.</p>
<p>School Economic Integration: The percentage of students in schools where more than 75 percent of students are eligible for free or reduced-price lunch.</p>	<p>National Center for Education Statistics, Common Core of Data Data Files, 2014-15 Public Elementary/Secondary School Universe Survey Data 2014-2015</p>	<p>Performance: 3 points for <=10% students in high poverty schools; 2 points 11-20%; 1 point 21-30%; 0 points >30%</p> <p>Equity: 3 points for <=5% disparity gap; 2 points 6-10% gap; 1 point 11-15% gap; 0 points >15% gap</p>
<p>Well-resourced schools: The average teacher salary expenditures in a city's largest public school district. Salaries adjusted for cost of living.</p>	<p>Office for Civil Rights Data Collection SY 2013-14</p>	<p>Performance: 3 points for >=\$58,240, 2 points \$53,240 — 58,239, 1 point \$48,240 — 53,239; 0 points <\$48,240</p> <p>Note: This was based on the rationale that teachers should be making more than 400% federal poverty level after adjusting for cost of living as an absolute minimum, which for an individual would be \$12,060 x 4 = \$48,240. Average salaries must be above \$48,240 to receive a point, and every additional \$5,000 in average salary (approximately 10%) is an additional point.</p>
<p>Teacher Experience: The percentage of FTE teachers with more than two years' experience.</p>	<p>Office for Civil Rights Data Collection SY 2009-2010</p>	<p>Performance: 3 points for >=90% teachers with >2 years' experience; 2 points 80%-89% of teachers; 1 point 70-79% of teachers; 0 points <=70% teachers</p>



**Thermometer
Data**

Indicator Definition	Source
<p>Graduation rates: The regulatory four-year adjusted-cohort graduation rate is the number of students who graduate in four years with a regular high school diploma divided by the number of students who formed the cohort for that graduating class. The four-year adjusted cohort rate also includes students who graduate in less than four years.</p>	<p>United States Department of Education, ED-Facts Initiative SY 2010-11 – SY 2014-15</p>
<p>Adults with Associate degrees: The percentage of adults age 25 or older with an Associate degree or higher.</p>	<p>Integrated Public Use Microdata Series, 2015 5-year American Community Survey 2011-2015</p>
<p>Children Living Below Poverty: The percentage of children under age 18 with family income below the federal poverty level.</p>	<p>Integrated Public Use Microdata Series, 2015 5-year American Community Survey 2011-2015</p>
<p>Public School District Poverty: Percent of students in the school district that qualify for free or reduced-price lunch.</p>	<p>Office for Civil Rights Data Collection SY 2014-2015</p>
<p>Youth not in school or work: The percentage of people ages 16 through 24 who are not enrolled in school and not employed.</p>	<p>Integrated Public Use Microdata Series, 2015 5-year American Community Survey 2011-2015</p>
<p>Unemployment rate: The percentage of people in the labor force age 16 or older that are unemployed. Unemployed is defined as being without work and actively seeking it. The labor force includes those who are employed or unemployed.</p>	<p>Integrated Public Use Microdata Series, 2015 5-year American Community Survey 2011-2015</p>
<p>Limited English Proficiency: The percentage of students in the district whose native language is a language other than English.</p>	<p>Office for Civil Rights Data Collection SY 2014-2015</p>
<p>Infant mortality: The number of deaths to persons aged less than 365 days per 1000 live births. Universe includes all live births.</p>	<p>Centers for Disease Control and Prevention WONDER Online Databases 2011-2014</p>